FROM UNIVERSE

TO PLANETS LECTURE 3: DUST TO PLANETESIMALS

REVIEW: DUST SIZES AND MASSES



REVIEW: DUST SIZES AND MASSES



INITIAL DUST DISTRIBUTION

- ISM has a dust-to-gas ratio of ~0.01 with sizes ranging from nm-µm
- Early growth may occur, but collapse of GMCs can be messy and not all grains survive
- Only presolar grains are known for sure to survive:
 - Small refractory grains like nano-diamonds, graphite particles, or silicon carbide (SiC) grains.
- Meanwhile, new dust grains condense out in the disc
 - Refractory elements in the inner disc
 - Volatile elements beyond snow lines



INHERITED FROM ISM



EARLY GROWTH

Caveat: the first hydrostatic core lasts until $T \sim 2000$ K, when H₂ dissociates. However, dust already sublimates at $T \gtrsim 1500$ K



credit: Bate (2022)

FROM UNIVERSE

TO PLANETS LECTURE 3.1: CONDENSATION







Planetary Atmospheres







Stellar Winds and Supernovae









Protoplanetary disc

- Snowflakes form high in Earth's atmosphere, where the temperature and air pressure is low
- Water molecules in gas clouds bypass the liquid water stage and condense directly into ice crystals





DISCOVER How do snowflakes form? * The shape of a snowflake is influenced by the temperature of the atmosphere, and because the snowflake is constantly moving through various temperatures, the shape is always changing. * Warmer air on way down will As snowflake cause long, narrow tips grows heavier, Nucleator it begins to If it is cold enough the whole (Dust grain fall way down, the flake will still be As it travels floating in frozen when it reaches surface more water the air) particles condense onto it and freeze and Water grow. vapour in air sticks to dust grain Crystal may encounter warm air Q: Why are Droplet followed by turns into no two snowflakes cooler air. exactly alike? ice: causing more crystal A: Because individual side branches faces snowflakes follow slightly appear different paths to the ground, they each encounter slightly different atmospheric conditions Prism along the way forms with six faces, a top and a bottom 6 A cavity forms in each prism face, (As seen because ice grows from fastest near the above) edges At 6°F side Cavity 0 As droplet continues At 9°F, new branches begin to rise, temperature to sprout growth at gets colder branch tips

narrows

Sources: American Chemical Society; LiveScience

SUSAN BATSFORD, GRAPHICS EDITOR, TWITTER @SBATS1; INFOGRAPHIC BY MEGAN DINNER/QMI AGENCY

- A similar process occurs for refractory elements in protoplanetary discs as gas cools at very low pressures
 - First elements condense directly into mineral crystals at ~1,500 °C



- ► Oxide minerals rich in calcium, aluminium and titanium → Calcium-Aluminium Inclusions (CAIs)
- At lower temperatures (≤ 1 Myr after CAIs), crystals of minerals containing magnesium, silicon and iron began to condense \rightarrow chondrules



Ages to Present (Ma)

Ages from the Beginning of Solar System (Ma)



3. Agglomeration

DIFFERENT TYPES OF METEORITE



IRON METEORITES

Iron-nickel crystals

> Iron meteorites come from the core

come from

Mesosiderites form when two asteroid collide

STONY-IRON METEORITES

Stony-Iron meteorites are made of a mix of both metallic and rocky material. They probably formed when the metal cores and the rocky magmas inside asteroids mixed together, which makes them extremely rare. There are two types of stony-iron meteorites: pallasites and mesosiderites.

> Olivine crystals

Iron meteorites are made of about 90-95% iron with the rest made up of mostly nickel and some trace elements. It is thought that they come from the metallic cores of asteroids. Iron meteorites are rarer than stony meteorites but are easier to find because of their magnetism.

MESOSIDERITE

Mesosiderites differ from pallasites in that their crystals are smaller and made of silicate minerals. It is thought that mesosiderites form when magma mixes with the core during a collision between two asteroids.

Pallasite

near the core

PALLASITE

Pallasites have solid bodies of nickel and iron but also contain large translucent crystals of olivine. Pallasites come from the area between the metallic core of an asteroid and the surrounding rocky magma.

Small silicate crystals

Credit: Ben Gilliland, STFC Borrow the Moon

DIFFERENT TYPES OF METEORITE



STONY METEORITES Stony meteorites are the most common type of meteorite. They are made of rock, but can also contain small amounts of iron. There are two types of stony meteorites: chondrites and achondrites.

Chondrites come from undifferentiated asteroids

CHONDRITE

Chondrites contain rock that has changed little since the formation of the Solar System. They are made up of small mineral blobs called chondrules that formed in space billions of years ago and became clumped together.

Chrondules



ACHONDRITE

Achondrites are much younger than chrondrites. They contain minerals which have been melted. changed and altered since they were formed.

Achondrites come from the crust of asteroids or planets

NON-ASTEROID BELT

Not all meteorites come from the Asteroid Belt. Sometimes, very large collisions between an asteroid and a planet or moon can allow material from the surface to be ejected into space and sent on a trajectory that will overlap with the Earth's. This is, thus far, the only way we are able to get our hands on material from Mars.



Credit: Ben Gilliland, STFC Borrow the Moon

CHONDRITES

- Carbonaceous chondrites show
 little chemical differentiation and
 fractionation
 - Primitive: provide clues to the initial chemical composition of the solar nebula

Carbonaceous Chondrite



Contain volatile organic chemicals and water \rightarrow no significant heating (>200 °C)

CHONDRITES

- Cl-chondrites (the l is for lvuna): most primitive sub-class
 - Contain H₂O (17-22%; bound in silicates), Fe (25%; in form of iron oxides), C (3-5%), amino acids, and PAHs



- Have not been heated above 50 °C (formed and remained beyond ~ 4 au)
- Relative elemental abundances are similar to the Sun's photosphere (notable exceptions are Li, used in nucleosynthesis, and volatile elements like H and O)



Near one-to-one correlation between elemental abundances found in Sun and CI chondrites



Figure 3 Element/Si ratios of characteristic elements in various groups of chondritic (undifferentiated) meteorites normalized to respective ratios in CI chondrites. Meteorite groups are arranged in order of decreasing oxygen content. The best match between solar photosphere measurements and meteoritic abundances is with CI chondrites (see text for details).

- In a thermodynamical system, processes will continue spontaneously until the relevant thermodynamical potential is minimised. In equilibrium, e.g.:
 - Helmoltz free energy is minimised for isothermalisochoric systems: F = U - TS
 - Gibbs free energy (also called free enthalpy) is minimised for isothermal-isobaric systems: G = F + PV = (U - TS) + PV = H - TS(as opposed to enthalpy H = U + PV)

isobaric

adiabatic

Chemical reactions typically occur in isothermal-isobaric conditions at thermodynamical equilibrium.

• Using the first law of thermodynamics ($dU = \delta Q - PdV$):

$$G = H - TS \longrightarrow dG = dH - TdS - SdT$$
$$H = U + PV \longrightarrow dH = dU + PdV + VdP = \delta Q + VdP$$

For reversible processes (where entropy is $dS = \delta Q_{rev}/T$):

$$dG = \delta Q + VdP - T\left(\frac{\delta Q}{T}\right) - SdT = VdP - SdT$$

- In equilibrium, we can assume dG = 0 and the potential is defined to within a constant.
- Useful to define standard conditions to be used as a reference point, usually:

$$T_0 = 298 \text{ K}$$
 $P_0 = 1 \text{ atm}$

CONDENSATION: IRON EXAMPLE



CONDENSATION: FULL SEQUENCE

- In more detailed models, the partial pressure is not a horizontal line (relative abundances depend on T and P).
- Normally, spinel would condense at T = 1685 K, but corundum condenses first and removes Al and O, causing the slope of the partial pressure to change.
- Condensation for spinel now happens at T = 1500 K.



CONDENSATION: FULL SEQUENCE



FROM UNIVERSE

TO PLANETS LECTURE 3.2: GROWTH/FRAGMENTATION

EVIDENCE OF GRAIN GROWTH

Warm dust in inner regions is missing



EVIDENCE OF GRAIN GROWTH



COAGULATION

Vertical settling timescale is much faster than the radial drift timescale. Simple model: the dust sweeps
 up grains as it settles at terminal velocity.

$$dm = \pi a^2 |v_z| dt \quad \times \quad \underbrace{\rho_g \varepsilon}_{\sum}$$



$$v_{\rm d}^z = -z\Omega_{\rm K}{\rm St}(a,z)$$



Solving this numerically:

 Differences in the condensation sequence can fractionate the disc.



COAGULATION

 Vertical settling timescale is much faster than the radial drift timescale. Simple model: the dust sweeps up grains as it settles at terminal velocity.

$$dm = \pi a^2 |v_z| dt \quad \times \quad \underbrace{\rho_g \varepsilon}_{z}$$



$$v_{\rm d}^z = -z\Omega_{\rm K}{\rm St}(a,z)$$

Solving this numerically:

 Differences in the condensation sequence can fractionate the disc.













- Small particles are sticky, velocities given by Brownian motion.
- Turbulence and differential motion dominates for larger particles.
- Impact velocities increase with particle size \rightarrow problem!



time = 6827.8266

GROWTH BARRIERS


Only grain growth



Only grain growth



Grain growth and drift



Grain growth, drift, and fragmentation



OVERCOMING GROWTH BARRIERS

- Dust traps: usually associated with pressure maxima (zero gradient) → no radial or azimuthal drift.
 - Snow lines, turbulence, vortices, planet gaps, gravity, self-induced pile-ups.
- Trap larger grains, small grains follow gas (accretion and viscous spreading). Relative velocities only due to turbulence. Thus for small α, growth can continue.
- A few "lucky" particles in the tails of the velocity distribution may be able to grow to reach planetesimal sizes.



DUST TRAPS: PRESSURE BUMPS



GRAVITATIONAL INSTABILITY (GI)

- Goldreich-Ward instability: settling of small grains increases the dust-to-gas ratio at the disc mid-plane, until the dust layer becomes gravitationally unstable and fragments.
- Toomre criterion: the disc is unstable for $Q \lesssim 1$, where

$$Q \equiv \frac{c_{\rm s} \Omega_{\rm K}}{\pi G \Sigma}$$

 If Σ_{gas} ~ 100–1000 g cm⁻² and the dust-to-gas ratio is 0.01, then Q < 1 requires a disc temperature less than 1 K!



GRAVITATIONAL INSTABILITY (GI)

For instability, gravity must dominant over rotational and thermal energies:

 $\frac{E_{\text{therm}}}{E_{\text{grav}}} \frac{E_{\text{rot}}}{E_{\text{grav}}} < 1$

 $E_{\rm grav} \approx \frac{G(\pi R^2 \Sigma)}{R} = G \pi \Sigma R$ $E_{\rm rot} \approx \frac{1}{2} (\Omega_{\rm K} R)^2$ $E_{\rm therm} \approx \frac{3}{2}T \approx c_{\rm s}^2$

Plugging in expressions for the energies:

 $\frac{c_{\rm s}^2}{G\pi\Sigma R} \frac{\frac{1}{2}\Omega_{\rm K}^2 R^2}{G\pi\Sigma R} = \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{c_{\rm s}\Omega_{\rm K}}{\pi G\Sigma}\right)^2 \longrightarrow Q \equiv \frac{c_{\rm s}\Omega_{\rm K}}{\pi G\Sigma} \lesssim 1$

STREAMING INSTABILITY (SI)

- Dust experiences a headwind in discs, but if the dust layer of large grains (pebbles) is sufficiently compact and dense ($\sim 10^4 \times$ thinner and $\sim 100 \times$ denser than the gas!) then the dust accelerates the gas and reduces the headwind it feels. This has two consequences:
 - Radial drift is halted and dust drifting in from outside piles up.
 - The accelerated gas causes a pressure bump (dust trap).
- The process rapidly runs away until the clump becomes self-gravitating and collapses to form planetesimals.

STREAMING INSTABILITY (SI)

- ▶ While the compact dust layer is dynamically dominated by the dust, the layers above are still dominated by the gas → large vertical shear.
- Kelvin-Helmholtz Instability develop which increases the velocity dispersion of the dust layer.





STREAMING INSTABILITY (SI)





PLANETESIMAL FORMATION

354P/LINEAR



PLANETESIMAL FORMATION

- First collision of main astroid belt object detected on 6 January 2010.
- Its orbit in the main astroid belt, the never-before-seen X pattern (which remained intact), and the nucleus outside the main halo rule out the possibility of a comet.
- Probably created by the impact of a small m-size object on the larger asteroid (~150 m) in February/March 2009.
- Particle sizes in the tail are probably between 1 mm and 2.5 cm in diameter. The tail contains enough dust to make a sphere of diameter 20 m.

FROM UNIVERSE

TO PLANETS LECTURE 3.3: PLANETESIMALS

PLANETESIMAL COLLISIONS



GRAVITATIONAL FOCUSING



GRAVITATIONAL FOCUSING



GRAVITATIONAL FOCUSING

Angular momentum conservations gives:

$$J = 2 \cdot m \frac{\sigma}{2} \cdot \frac{b}{2} = 2 \cdot m v_{\max} \frac{R_c}{2} \longrightarrow v_{\max} = \frac{1}{2} \frac{\sigma b}{R_c}$$

т

Conservation of energy gives (upon inserting v_{max}):

$$E = 2 \cdot \frac{1}{2}m\left(\frac{\sigma}{2}\right)^2 = 2 \cdot \frac{1}{2}mv_{\max}^2 - \frac{Gm^2}{R_c} \longrightarrow b^2 = R_c^2 + \frac{4GmR_c}{\sigma^2}$$

 $\sigma/2$

Collisions only occur if $R_c < R_s$, where R_s is the sum of the sizes. Using the escape velocity ($v_{esc}^2 = 4Gm/R_s$):

maximum distance leading to a collision $b^2 = R_s^2$

$$= R_{\rm s}^2 \left(1 + \frac{v_{\rm esc}^2}{\sigma^2} \right)$$

collision cross-section $\Gamma = \pi R_s^2 \left(1 + \frac{v_{esc}^2}{\sigma^2} \right)$ (also valid for different *m*) Γ_{geo}

 $\hat{\mathbf{I}}$ impact parameter b

min. distance R_c

max. velocity v_{max}

 $\sigma/2$

GRAVITATIONAL BINDING ENERGY

Specific energy of the impact:

$$2 \equiv \frac{mv^2}{2M} = \frac{\text{impactor energy}}{\text{target mass}}$$

The gravitational binding energy for a sphere of uniform density:

$$E_{\rm grav} = \frac{3}{5} \frac{GM^2}{R}$$

Energy goes into heating phase changes, ejecta...



HILL RADIUS

 $\ddot{\mathbf{r}} = -\nabla \Phi \underbrace{-2(\mathbf{\Omega}_{\mathrm{K}} \times \dot{\mathbf{r}})}_{\mathrm{Coriolis Force}} \underbrace{-\Omega_{\mathrm{K}} \times (\mathbf{\Omega}_{\mathrm{K}} \times \mathbf{r})}_{\mathrm{Centrifugal Force}}$



HILL RADIUS

• Assuming $M_* \gg M_P$ and $\Delta = |\mathbf{r} - \mathbf{r}_P|$, we can simplify:



 \bigcirc

т



 $2\Delta a$



σ/2



 $2\Delta a$







σ/2

Width scales with hill radius: $r_{\rm H} = a_{\rm p} \sqrt[3]{\frac{M_{\rm p}}{3M_*}}$ $\Delta a_{\rm max} \approx C r_{\rm H}$

Mass in the feeding zone grows with planet mass:

$$M_{\rm fz} \approx 2\pi a_{\rm p} \cdot 2\Delta a_{\rm max} \cdot \Sigma_{\rm p} \propto M^{1/3}$$

 Isolation mass (maximum mass a body can achieve through planetesimal accretion) grows with cylindrical radius:

$$M_{\rm iso} = \frac{8}{\sqrt{3}} \pi^{3/2} C^{3/2} M_*^{-1/2} \Sigma^{3/2} a_{\rm p}^3$$

 $\begin{array}{ll} M_{\rm iso} \approx 0.07 \; M_{\oplus} & \mbox{in the terrestrial region} \\ M_{\rm iso} \approx 9 \; M_{\oplus} & \mbox{in the giant planet region} \end{array}$

SNOW LINES

- ALMA image of CO snow around the star TW Hydrae.
- The blue circle is about the size of Neptune's orbit in our Solar System.
- The transition to CO ice could mark the inner boundary of the region where smaller icy bodies
 like comets and dwarf planets would form (e.g. Pluto and Eris).

TW Hydrae

SNOW LINES

- For water ice: T_{snow} ~ 150-170 K, corresponding to R ~ 1-3 au. The snow line for the Solar System was probably at R = 2.7 au (since the outer asteroids are icy and the inner asteroids are largely devoid of water).
- At the snow line, the density of solid particles increases suddenly. This increase in solid-particle surface density affects the time-scales and mass-scales of planets that form beyond the snow line.



Gas giants form more easily beyond the snow line, since cores that form beyond the snow line are more massive and have a longer time to accrete gas from the disk before it dissipates.

ISOLATION MASS

- The timescale for planet formation is roughly $\tau \propto 1/\Sigma$ so planetary cores which form beyond the snow-line are much larger than those that form within it.
- Isolation mass: maximum mass a body can achieve through planetesimal accretion ($M_{\rm iso} \propto \Sigma^{3/2} a_P^3$).
- Amplification of the solid surface density by a factor of ~3-4 at the snow line leads to an amplified isolation mass by a factor of ~5-8.
- The snow-line facilitates gas giant formation by helping cores to reach runaway gas accretion sooner. Timing is crucial because they must accrete the gas before the disc is dispersed.

FROM UNIVERSE

LECTURE 3.4: PROTOPLANETS

RANDOM VELOCITIES

- Large number of planetesimals: statistical treatment
- Similar to gas molecules and kinetic gas theory
- "Hot" (many collisions, high velocity) vs. "cold" distributions
 - "Heating": mutual gravitational scattering
 - "Cooling": collisions, gas drag, ejection
- Treat eccentricity e, inclination i, and mass m using a distribution f(m, e, i)



RANDOM VELOCITIES

- The random velocities set the growth regime: orderly, runaway, or oligarchic. The key ingredients are:
 - Viscous stirring (increase of random velocities) through collisions or gravitational scattering between planetesimals and protoplanets.
 - Dynamical friction: energy transfer from large to small bodies
 - Establishes energy equipartition between bodies of different sizes.
 - Damping due to dissipation in inelastic collisions and through gas drag.

VISCOUS STIRRING

- Distant fly-bys produce small angle deflections.
- Transforms some of the forward velocity (kinetic energy) to a random perpendicular velocity/energy.
- Integration over all encounters gives the increase of the random kinetic energy.



VISCOUS STIRRING

- Distant fly-bys produce small angle deflections.
- Transforms some of the forward velocity (kinetic energy) to a random perpendicular velocity/energy.
- Integration over all encounters gives the increase of the random kinetic energy.



DYNAMICAL FRICTION

Same principle as before, but now with different masses.



DYNAMICAL FRICTION

- Same principle as before, but now with different masses.
- Massive body heats up its environment



Massive body is scattered less, smaller masses are scattered more. Many encounters lead to energy equipartition: 1 - 1

$$\frac{1}{2}m\sigma_m^2 = \frac{1}{2}M\sigma_m^2$$




 Gas drag is similar to that of smaller particles, but sizes are large enough to put them in the hydrodynamic (Stokes) regime.



 Gas drag is similar to that of smaller particles, but sizes are large enough to put them in the hydrodynamic (Stokes) regime.



 Gas drag is similar to that of smaller particles, but sizes are large enough to put them in the hydrodynamic (Stokes) regime.





- Gas drag is similar to that of smaller particles, but sizes are large enough to put them in the hydrodynamic (Stokes) regime.
- Damping acts against viscous stirring, thereby facilitating growth. For strong damping, the system evolves into a shear dominated regime (thin planetesimal disc). The 2D dynamics lead to high collisional probabilities and large focussing factors → large growth rates.

F_{Stokes}

Assuming the random velocity is $v \sim ev_{\rm K}$, the damping timescales is approximately:

 $\tau_{\rm damp,gas} \approx \frac{mv}{F_{\rm drag}} = \frac{2m}{C_{\rm D}\pi a^2 \rho_{\rm gas} e v_{\rm K}} \propto a$

ORDERLY AND RUNAWAY GROWTH

 Γ =focusing factor

 Recall our mass accretion rate including the focusing factor:

$$\frac{dM_{\rm p}}{dt} = \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2} \Sigma_{\rm p} \Omega_{\rm K} \pi R_{\rm s}^2 \left(1 + \frac{v_{\rm esc}^2}{\sigma^2}\right)$$

 Depending on the velocity dispersion, we get two different growth regimes:

$$\frac{1}{M_{\rm p}} \frac{dM_{\rm p}}{dt} \propto \begin{cases} M_{\rm p}^{-1/3}, & \sigma \gg v_{\rm esc} \text{ (orderly)} \\ M_{\rm p}^{1/3}, & \sigma \ll v_{\rm esc} \text{ (runaway)} \end{cases}$$

- Viscous stirring increases σ , leading to orderly growth, with a powerlaw size distribution having most of the mass in the largest bodies
- Addition of Dynamical friction and gas drag tends to equalise kinetic energies and damp *o* of the more massive bodies, leading to runaway growth of a small number of embryos

ORDERLY AND RUNAWAY GROWTH



- Viscous stirring increases σ, leading to orderly growth, with a powerlaw size distribution having most of the mass in the largest bodies
- Addition of Dynamical friction and gas drag tends to equalise kinetic energies and damp *o* of the more massive bodies, leading to runaway growth of a small number of embryos

OLIGARCHIC GROWTH

- Runaway growth continues until the feedback from the big bodies stirs up the neighbouring planetesimals again
- Growth rates slows (similar to orderly growth), but are still faster than planetesimals in their surroundings (similar to runaway growth)

• Transition from runaway to oligarchic growth occurs between $10^{-3}-10^{-2} M_{\oplus}$



OLIGARCHIC GROWTH



GAS ACCRETION

- Gas accretion begins very slowly because it is pressure supported. Prevents new gas from being accreted.
- Once a critical core mass is achieved, runaway gas 7. Kelvin-Helmholtz contraction accretion becomes very rapid.

5. Runaway accretion

3. Hydrostatic growth

1. Core formation

2. Atmosphere formation

4. Exceed critical core mass

6. Gas dispersal

GAS ACCRETION: RUNAWAY GROWTH

Accounting for boundary conditions (attached vs detached) leads to a step-like growth behaviour:



GAS ACCRETION: RUNAWAY GROWTH



SUMMARY 1/3

- Disc temperature is important for determining the condensation sequence, which affects the chemistry of solids in the disc.
 - CI-chondrites show the least processing and closely match the abundances in the Sun. Give a good window on the chemical composition of the solar nebula.
- Growth of small grains initially occurs through collisions, but the growth efficiency drops near cm sizes due to bouncing, fragmentation, and radial drift.
 - Dust traps are essential to prevent the solid material from draining onto the star.
 - Likely need another mechanism to make the jump to planetesimal sizes.

SUMMARY 2/3

- Planetesimals again grow through collisions, but are now large enough for self-gravity to play an important role.
 - Gravitational focusing and internal structure.
- Once planets get too large, they reach an isolation mass, where the growth due to planetesimal accretion slows down dramatically.
 - Snow lines play an important role in accelerating core formation and allowing cores to reach the runaway gas accretion phase before the gas in the disc is dispersed.

SUMMARY 3/3

- Velocity dispersion and growth rates are co-dependent:
 - Velocity dispersion:
 - Viscous stirring
 - Dynamical friction
 - Gas damping

- Different growth rates:
 - Orderly growth
 - Runaway solid accretion
 - Oligarchic growth

- Runaway gas accretion
 - Core mass is large enough ($\gtrsim 10 \ {\rm M}_\oplus$)
 - Gas is still present and is able to cool efficiently